

Message

**From:** Branning, Amy [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=A3F510CCED11492D88CC26ED073B7F10-ABRANNIN]  
**Sent:** 8/3/2017 7:30:29 PM  
**To:** Fotouhi, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=febaf0d56aab43f8a9174b18218c1182-Fotouhi, Da]; Schmidt, Lorie [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f471d4b316f74b0591322b5c63f1d01c-Schmidt, Lorie]; Zenick, Elliott [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b2eaa2a560d415fb7c8ce9bb56c7ce5-EZENICK]; Srinivasan, Gautam [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d69332838210416ba51779b19025f832-GSRINIVA]  
**Subject:** FW: 17-1145 Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al "Reply to Response Filed" (EPA-82FR25730)  
**Attachments:** Clean Air Council PFREB Resp Intervenor Reply.pdf

Just got this. Getting on a conf call so have not had time to read it.

Amy Huang Branning  
EPA Office of General Counsel  
phone: (202) 564-1744  
fax: (202) 564-5603 or (202) 564-0070

This message may contain sensitive, privileged information covered by the deliberative process, attorney-client and/or attorney work product privileges. If you believe you have received this e-mail in error, please notify me and delete the e-mail immediately.

**From:** Carlisle, Benjamin (ENRD) [mailto:Benjamin.Carlisle@usdoj.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 03, 2017 3:28 PM  
**To:** Branning, Amy <Branning.Amy@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Lipshultz, Jon (ENRD) <Jon.Lipshultz@usdoj.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: 17-1145 Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al "Reply to Response Filed" (EPA-82FR25730)

Amy,

Attached is Respondent-Intervenor's reply brief.

Ben Carlisle  
Trial Attorney  
United States Department of Justice  
Environment and Natural Resources Division  
Environmental Defense Section  
601 D. St. NW, Room 8406  
Washington DC, 20004  
[Benjamin.carlisle@usdoj.gov](mailto:Benjamin.carlisle@usdoj.gov)  
202-514-9771

**From:** [ecfnoticing@cadc.uscourts.gov](mailto:ecfnoticing@cadc.uscourts.gov) [mailto:[ecfnoticing@cadc.uscourts.gov](mailto:ecfnoticing@cadc.uscourts.gov)]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 03, 2017 3:22 PM  
**To:** Carlisle, Benjamin (ENRD) <[BCarlisle@ENRD.USDOJ.GOV](mailto:BCarlisle@ENRD.USDOJ.GOV)>  
**Subject:** 17-1145 Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al "Reply to Response Filed" (EPA-82FR25730)

**\*\*\*NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS\*\*\*** Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing.

**United States Court of Appeals for District of Columbia Circuit**

**Notice of Docket Activity**

The following transaction was entered on 08/03/2017 at 3:21:34 PM EDT and filed on 08/03/2017

**Case Name:** Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al  
**Case Number:** 17-1145  
**Document(s):** Document(s)

**Docket Text:**

*JOINT* REPLY [1687220] filed by American Exploration & Production Council, American Petroleum Institute, Domestic Energy Producers Alliance, Eastern Kansas Oil & Gas Association, GPA Midstream Association, Illinois Oil and Gas Association, Independent Oil and Gas Association of West Virginia, Inc., Independent Petroleum Association of America, Indiana Oil and Gas Association, International Association of Drilling Contractors, Interstate Natural Gas Association of America, Kansas Independent Oil and Gas Association, Kentucky Oil and Gas Association, Michigan Oil and Gas Association, National Stripper Well Association, North Dakota Petroleum Council, Ohio Oil and Gas Association, Oklahoma Independent Petroleum Association, Pennsylvania Independent Oil & Gas Association, Texas Alliance of Energy Producers, Texas Independent Products & Royalty Owners Association, Texas Oil and Gas Association, West Virginia Oil and Natural Gas Association and Western Energy Alliance to response [1687021-2] [Service Date: 08/03/2017 by CM/ECF NDA] Length Certification: 1,837 words. [17-1145] (Wehrum, William)

**Notice will be electronically mailed to:**

Mr. Tim David Ballo: [tballo@earthjustice.org](mailto:tballo@earthjustice.org), [lfuhrmann@earthjustice.org](mailto:lfuhrmann@earthjustice.org), [alin@earthjustice.org](mailto:alin@earthjustice.org), [rwinz@earthjustice.org](mailto:rwinz@earthjustice.org)  
Mr. James D. Elliott, Counsel: [jelliott@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:jelliott@spilmanlaw.com), [lisom@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:lisom@spilmanlaw.com), [sstoner@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:sstoner@spilmanlaw.com)  
Mr. James Emory Smith, Jr., Assistant Attorney General: [esmith@scag.gov](mailto:esmith@scag.gov)  
Michael J. Myers, Assistant Attorney General: [michael.myers@ag.ny.gov](mailto:michael.myers@ag.ny.gov)  
Ms. Shannon S. Broome, Attorney: [sbroome@hunton.com](mailto:sbroome@hunton.com), [TCremer@hunton.com](mailto:TCremer@hunton.com)  
Ms. Morgan Anna Costello, Assistant Attorney General: [morgan.costello@ag.ny.gov](mailto:morgan.costello@ag.ny.gov)  
Benna Ruth Solomon, Deputy Corporation Counsel: [benna.solomon@cityofchicago.org](mailto:benna.solomon@cityofchicago.org), [david.franco@cityofchicago.org](mailto:david.franco@cityofchicago.org)  
Mr. Matthew Ivan Levine, Assistant Attorney General: [matthew.levine@ct.gov](mailto:matthew.levine@ct.gov), [scott.koschwitz@ct.gov](mailto:scott.koschwitz@ct.gov)  
Charles Howland Knauss: [cknauss@hunton.com](mailto:cknauss@hunton.com), [sbroome@pacbell.net](mailto:sbroome@pacbell.net), [rpavlak@hunton.com](mailto:rpavlak@hunton.com), [TLewis@hunton.com](mailto:TLewis@hunton.com)  
Ms. Ann Brewster Weeks, Senior Counsel: [aweeks@catf.us](mailto:aweeks@catf.us)  
Mr. Robert D. Snook, Assistant Attorney General: [Robert.Snook@ct.gov](mailto:Robert.Snook@ct.gov)  
Samuel B. Boxerman: [sboxerman@sidley.com](mailto:sboxerman@sidley.com), [dcefilingnotice@sidley.com](mailto:dcefilingnotice@sidley.com)  
Joanne Marie Spalding: [joanne.spalding@sierraclub.org](mailto:joanne.spalding@sierraclub.org), [harry.libarle@sierraclub.org](mailto:harry.libarle@sierraclub.org)  
Sean H. Donahue: [sean@donahuegoldberg.com](mailto:sean@donahuegoldberg.com)  
John G. Horne, II: [john.horne@ky.gov](mailto:john.horne@ky.gov)

William L. Wehrum, Jr.: [wwehrum@hunton.com](mailto:wwehrum@hunton.com), [caapleadings@hunton.com](mailto:caapleadings@hunton.com), [sfisher@hunton.com](mailto:sfisher@hunton.com), [jacksonp@hunton.com](mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com)

Mr. William G. Grantham, Assistant Attorney General: [wgrantham@nmag.gov](mailto:wgrantham@nmag.gov), [bmcmath@nmag.gov](mailto:bmcmath@nmag.gov)

Edward N. Siskel: [edward.siskel@cityofchicago.org](mailto:edward.siskel@cityofchicago.org)

Mr. Gregory Stage Schultz: [gschultz@riag.ri.gov](mailto:gschultz@riag.ri.gov), [kragosta@riag.ri.gov](mailto:kragosta@riag.ri.gov)

Paul Martin Seby, Attorney: [sebyp@gtlaw.com](mailto:sebyp@gtlaw.com), [lawsu@gtlaw.com](mailto:lawsu@gtlaw.com), [DENLitDock@GTLAW.com](mailto:DENLitDock@GTLAW.com)

Barbara D. Underwood, Solicitor General: [barbara.underwood@ag.ny.gov](mailto:barbara.underwood@ag.ny.gov), [nyoag.nycpdf@ag.ny.gov](mailto:nyoag.nycpdf@ag.ny.gov)

Ms. Vickie Lynn Patton: [vpattson@edf.org](mailto:vpattson@edf.org)

Gerald T. Karr: [gakarr@atg.state.il.us](mailto:gakarr@atg.state.il.us)

Mr. David D. Doniger: [ddoniger@nrdc.org](mailto:ddoniger@nrdc.org)

Ms. Roberta Rose James: [roberta.james@maryland.gov](mailto:roberta.james@maryland.gov)

Mr. Elbert Lin, Solicitor General: [elbert.lin@wvago.gov](mailto:elbert.lin@wvago.gov), [leigh.a.brawley@wvago.gov](mailto:leigh.a.brawley@wvago.gov)

Mr. Patrick J. Morrissey: [patrick.morrissey@wvago.gov](mailto:patrick.morrissey@wvago.gov)

Thomas Michael Johnson, Jr., Deputy Solicitor: [tjohnson@wvago.gov](mailto:tjohnson@wvago.gov)

Meleah Anne Geertsma: [mgeertsma@nrdc.org](mailto:mgeertsma@nrdc.org), [hsun-kim@nrdc.org](mailto:hsun-kim@nrdc.org), [cpoliti@nrdc.org](mailto:cpoliti@nrdc.org)

Mr. Adam M. Kron, Senior Attorney: [akron@environmentalintegrity.org](mailto:akron@environmentalintegrity.org)

Mr. Peter Michel Zalzal, Attorney: [pzalzal@edf.org](mailto:pzalzal@edf.org)

Mr. Jeffrey Allyn Chanay: [jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov](mailto:jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov), [donna.wells@ag.ks.gov](mailto:donna.wells@ag.ks.gov)

Mr. Andres Jose Restrepo, Litigation Counsel: [andres.restrepo@sierraclub.org](mailto:andres.restrepo@sierraclub.org)

Mr. Scott Norman Koschwitz, Assistant Attorney General: [scott.koschwitz@ct.gov](mailto:scott.koschwitz@ct.gov)

Steven Beuregard Jones, Assistant Attorney General: [jonesst@ag.state.la.us](mailto:jonesst@ag.state.la.us)

Mr. Steven Wu: [steven.wu@ag.ny.gov](mailto:steven.wu@ag.ny.gov)

Mr. P. Clayton Eubanks: [clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov](mailto:clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov), [fc.docket@oag.state.ok.us](mailto:fc.docket@oag.state.ok.us), [clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov](mailto:clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov), [cara.gorden@oag.ok.gov](mailto:cara.gorden@oag.ok.gov)

Mr. Darin T. Schroeder: [dschroeder@catf.us](mailto:dschroeder@catf.us)

Ms. Sandra Snyder: [ssnyder@ingaa.org](mailto:ssnyder@ingaa.org), [nbyers@ingaa.org](mailto:nbyers@ingaa.org)

Mr. Paul Andrew Garrahan: [paul.garrahan@doj.state.or.us](mailto:paul.garrahan@doj.state.or.us)

Mr. Tomas Elias Carbonell, Attorney: [tcarbonell@edf.org](mailto:tcarbonell@edf.org)

John Robert Jacus, Attorney: [john.jacus@dgsllaw.com](mailto:john.jacus@dgsllaw.com), [kathleen.daily@dgsllaw.com](mailto:kathleen.daily@dgsllaw.com)

Ms. Melissa Ann Hoffer, Assistant Attorney General: [Melissa.Hoffer@state.ma.us](mailto:Melissa.Hoffer@state.ma.us)

Mr. Andrew Lynn Brasher, Deputy Solicitor: [abrasher@ago.state.al.us](mailto:abrasher@ago.state.al.us), [mnewman@ago.state.al.us](mailto:mnewman@ago.state.al.us)

Mrs. Jacquelyn Alirezay Quarles: [Jackie.Quarles@ky.gov](mailto:Jackie.Quarles@ky.gov)

Mr. Misha Tseytlin, Attorney: [tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us), [millerac@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:millerac@doj.state.wi.us), [deusterse@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:deusterse@doj.state.wi.us), [muirheadrw@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:muirheadrw@doj.state.wi.us)

Mr. Bryan Charles Clark, Assistant Solicitor General: [bryan.clark@ag.ks.gov](mailto:bryan.clark@ag.ks.gov), [donna.wells@ks.ag.gov](mailto:donna.wells@ks.ag.gov)

Mr. Aaron D. Lindstrom: [LindstromA@michigan.gov](mailto:LindstromA@michigan.gov), [GustafsonH@michigan.gov](mailto:GustafsonH@michigan.gov), [RestucciaE@michigan.gov](mailto:RestucciaE@michigan.gov), [BlackC9@michigan.gov](mailto:BlackC9@michigan.gov)

Eric Murphy, Solicitor: [eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov), [kim.blankenship@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:kim.blankenship@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)

Felicia Hope Barnes: [fbarnes@hunton.com](mailto:fbarnes@hunton.com), [caapleadings@hunton.com](mailto:caapleadings@hunton.com), [jacksonp@hunton.com](mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com)

Delanie Marie Breuer: [breuerdm@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:breuerdm@doj.state.wi.us), [deusterse@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:deusterse@doj.state.wi.us)

Jonathan Scott Goldman, Attorney: [jgoldman@attorneygeneral.gov](mailto:jgoldman@attorneygeneral.gov), [ARC-Court@attorneygeneral.gov](mailto:ARC-Court@attorneygeneral.gov), [lsheidy@attorneygeneral.gov](mailto:lsheidy@attorneygeneral.gov)

Dale Schowengerdt: [dales@mt.gov](mailto:dales@mt.gov), [asolem@mt.gov](mailto:asolem@mt.gov), [edoj@mt.gov](mailto:edoj@mt.gov), [beholnbeck@mt.gov](mailto:beholnbeck@mt.gov)

Jacob John Larson: [jacob.larson@iowa.gov](mailto:jacob.larson@iowa.gov), [jacob.larson@iowa.gov](mailto:jacob.larson@iowa.gov)

Mr. Nicholas Frank Persampieri: [nick.persampieri@vermont.gov](mailto:nick.persampieri@vermont.gov)

Mr. Craig James Pritzlaff, Assistant Attorney General: [craig.pritzlaff@oag.texas.gov](mailto:craig.pritzlaff@oag.texas.gov), [david.laurent@oag.texas.gov](mailto:david.laurent@oag.texas.gov), [Sandra.Woods@oag.texas.gov](mailto:Sandra.Woods@oag.texas.gov), [Virginia.Weldon@oag.texas.gov](mailto:Virginia.Weldon@oag.texas.gov)

Katharine Gould Shirey, Assistant Attorney General: [kaysl@atg.wa.gov](mailto:kaysl@atg.wa.gov), [ECYOLYEF@ATG.WA.GOV](mailto:ECYOLYEF@ATG.WA.GOV), [meaghan.kohler@atg.wa.gov](mailto:meaghan.kohler@atg.wa.gov)

Andrew G. Beshear, Attorney: [andy.beshear@ky.gov](mailto:andy.beshear@ky.gov), [susan.rieber@ky.gov](mailto:susan.rieber@ky.gov), [jan.velez@ky.gov](mailto:jan.velez@ky.gov)

Susannah Weaver: [susannah@donahuegoldberg.com](mailto:susannah@donahuegoldberg.com)

Matthew Arnold Sagsveen, Assistant Attorney General: [masagsve@nd.gov](mailto:masagsve@nd.gov)

Alice Henderson: [ahenderson@edf.org](mailto:ahenderson@edf.org)  
Ms. Erica Peterson, Assistant Attorney General: [erica.n.peterson@wvago.gov](mailto:erica.n.peterson@wvago.gov)  
Benjamin Carlisle, Trial Attorney: [benjamin.carlisle@usdoj.gov](mailto:benjamin.carlisle@usdoj.gov)  
Mr. Samuel Robert Flynn, Assistant Attorney General: [samuel.flynn@ky.gov](mailto:samuel.flynn@ky.gov), [jan.velez@ky.gov](mailto:jan.velez@ky.gov)  
Joel Minor: [jminor@earthjustice.org](mailto:jminor@earthjustice.org), [egreer@earthjustice.org](mailto:egreer@earthjustice.org)  
Mr. David S. Frankel: [david.frankel@ag.ny.gov](mailto:david.frankel@ag.ny.gov)  
Mr. Peter Charles Mulcahy, Assistant Attorney General: [peter.mulcahy@state.ma.us](mailto:peter.mulcahy@state.ma.us)  
Mr. Daniel Recht: [dan@rklawpc.com](mailto:dan@rklawpc.com), [erin@rklawpc.com](mailto:erin@rklawpc.com)  
Mr. Mark Grueskin: [mark@rklawpc.com](mailto:mark@rklawpc.com), [erin@rklawpc.com](mailto:erin@rklawpc.com)  
Ms. Heather R. Hanneman: [heather@rechtkornfeld.com](mailto:heather@rechtkornfeld.com), [erin@rklawpc.com](mailto:erin@rklawpc.com)  
Richard K. Kornfeld: [rick@rechtkornfeld.com](mailto:rick@rechtkornfeld.com), [erin@rklawpc.com](mailto:erin@rklawpc.com)

**Document to be served by alternative means on:**

Mr. Karl A. Racine  
Office of the Attorney General, District of Columbia  
Office of the Solicitor General  
441 4th Street, NW  
One Judiciary Square, Sixth Floor  
Washington, DC 20001-2714

Timothy C. Fox  
Office of the Attorney General, State of Montana  
215 North Sanders  
Justice Building  
Helena, MT 59620-1401

Matthew Denn  
Office of the Attorney General, State of Delaware  
820 North French Street  
6th Floor, Carvel State Office Building  
Wilmington, DE 19801-0000

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

**Document Description:** Reply to Response Filed

**Original Filename:** FinalReply070317.pdf

**Electronic Document Stamp:**

[STAMP acecfStamp\_ID=1109186823 [Date=08/03/2017] [FileNumber=1687220-0]

[aefb31cbcae68ae9955e42f7fca448f92a5112a6852dd828ab4899fc2f35b0ca0b6c6c6bf1167940bc762f494f60454b9c71d4fc23d428250acea58f1d6fdea4]]